# U.S. Department of Education Office for Civil Rights Philadelphia Office

The Wanamaker Building 100 Penn Square East, Suite 515 Philadelphia, PA 19107-3323

#### ADMINISTRATIVE CLASS COMPLAINT

## **COMPLAINANT**

Women's Law Project 125 South 9th Street, Suite 300 Philadelphia, PA 19107

PHONE: 215-928-5771 FAX: 215-928-9848

EMAIL: tfromson@womenslawproject.org

## **RECIPIENT**

Bloomsburg University of Pennsylvania 400 East Second Street Bloomsburg PA 17815-1301

PHONE: 570-389-4000

#### I. PRELIMINARY STATEMENT

- 1. This complaint is filed by the Women's Law Project pursuant to Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972, 20 U.S.C. § 1681 *et seq.* ("Title IX") and the regulations and policies promulgated thereunder. *See* 34 C.F.R. § 106 *et seq.* Title IX prohibits discrimination on the basis of sex in federally funded education programs and activities, including athletics.
- 2. As detailed in the Factual and Legal Allegations below, data submitted by Bloomsburg University of Pennsylvania ("Bloomsburg") to the Office of Postsecondary Education of the U.S. Department of Education pursuant to the Equity in Athletics Disclosure Act ("EADA"), 20 U.S.C. § 1092, as well as information collected from Bloomsburg's website indicates that Bloomsburg is discriminating on the basis of sex by providing unequal athletic participation opportunities and unequal athletic recruitment and financial assistance funding for its female students.
- 3. In order to address these disparities, the Women's Law Project requests that the Philadelphia Office for Civil Rights ("OCR") investigate Bloomsburg to determine whether it is providing women equal opportunities to participate in varsity sports and adequately equivalent recruitment and financial assistance funding as required by Title IX and remedy any unlawful conduct.

### II. JURISDICTION

- 4. The Philadelphia OCR is responsible for ensuring compliance with Title IX and receiving information about, investigating, and remedying violations of Title IX and its implementing regulations and guidelines in this region. 34 C.F.R. §§ 106.71, 100.7.
- 5. The Women's Law Project has not filed this complaint with any other agency or institution.
- 6. As Bloomsburg currently violates Title IX's participation, recruitment, and athletic financial assistance requirements, this complaint is timely.

## III. FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

- 7. Bloomsburg is part of the Pennsylvania State System of Higher Education and is located in central Pennsylvania.
- 8. Bloomsburg receives federal financial assistance and is therefore prohibited from discriminating on the basis of sex pursuant to Title IX.
- 9. Data submitted by Bloomsburg to the U.S. Department of Education pursuant to the EADA that is publicly available on the Office of Postsecondary Education Web site for academic years 2003-04 through 2012-13 indicates that Bloomsburg is not currently and has not in the past been providing female athletes equal opportunities to participate in athletics under Title IX's three-part participation test.

	Undergraduate Enrollment				Athletic Participation					
Year	Men	Women	Total	Percent Women	Men	Women	Total	Percent Women	Partici pation Gap	Athletes Needed for Equity
2003-04	2747	4227	6974	60.61%	293	200	493	40.57%	20.04%	251
2004-05	2809	4220	7029	60.04%	288	190	478	39.75%	20.29%	243
2005-06	2889	4368	7257	60.19%	268	214	482	44.40%	15.79%	191
2006-07	2976	4320	7296	59.21%	264	188	452	41.59%	17.62%	195
2007-08	3079	4237	7316	57.91%	273	211	484	43.60%	14.32%	165
2008-09	3163	4329	7492	57.78%	307	225	532	42.29%	15.49%	195
2009-10	3421	4652	8073	57.62%	306	239	545	43.85%	13.77%	177
2010-11	3671	4892	8563	57.13%	299	233	532	43.80%	13.33%	165
2011-12	3740	4911	8651	56.77%	306	238	544	43.75%	13.02%	164
2012-13	3748	4850	8598	56.41%	301	207	508	40.75%	15.66%	182

10. Bloomsburg does not and has not provided athletic opportunities to female students in numbers substantially proportionate to their enrollment pursuant to part one of the Title IX participation test. The participation gap from 2003-04 to 2012-13 for women at

Bloomsburg ranged from 20.29 percent in 2004-05 to 13.02 percent in 2011-12, averaging 16 percent over the ten academic years.

- 11. In 2012-13, the most recent academic year for which EADA data is available, Bloomsburg's participation gap was 15.66 percent.
- 12. Bloomsburg must add 182 additional athletic opportunities for women in order to provide athletic opportunities substantially proportionate to enrollment; 182 additional opportunities is far more than the amount needed to add even one new women's team.
- 13. The EADA data and evidence gathered on Bloomsburg's website show that Bloomsburg does not have a history and continuing practice of expanding athletic participation opportunities for women, pursuant to part two of the Title IX participation test.
  - 14. Bloomsburg has not added any women's teams in the past decade.
- 15. Bloomsburg does not have a record of increasing the number of female athletes. Over the ten year academic years covered by the available EADA data, Bloomsburg achieved a total net gain of only 7 women's athletic opportunities.
- 16. A review of Bloomsburg's website did not uncover any policy or procedure for adding new sports or elevating existing club sports to varsity status. Nor did it reveal any athletic gender equity plan or any gender equity committee.
- 17. Bloomsburg sponsors 10 men's varsity sports (Basketball, Cross Country, Football, Indoor Track, Outdoor Track, Soccer, Baseball, Swimming, Tennis, and Wrestling) and 10 women's varsity sports (Basketball, Cross Country, Field Hockey, Indoor Track, Outdoor Track, Lacrosse, Soccer, Softball, Swimming, and Tennis).
- 18. Information available on Bloomsburg's website suggests that the university is not accommodating the interests and abilities of female athletes as required by part three of the Title IX participation test. Bloomsburg has three all-women club teams that do not have a varsity equivalent: equestrian, rugby, and volleyball. *Available Teams*, Bloomsburg University of Pennsylvania, http://www.bloomu.edu/club\_sports/teams (last viewed Dec. 6, 2013). The Equestrian Team has fifty-four members on its roster. *Club Sports-Equestrian*, Bloomsburg University of Pennsylvania, http://www.bloomu.edu/club-equestrian (last viewed Dec. 6, 2013). The Women's Rugby Team has twenty-two members on its roster. *Club Sports-Women's Rugby*, Bloomsburg University of Pennsylvania, http://www.bloomu.edu/club-rugby-women (last viewed Dec. 6, 2013). The Women's Volleyball Team has twenty-one members on its roster. *Club Sports-Women's Volleyball*, Bloomsburg University of Pennsylvania, http://www.bloomu.edu/club-volleyball-women (last viewed Dec. 6, 2013).
- 19. The Pennsylvania State Athletic Conference (PSAC), in which Bloomsburg competes against other conference members, sponsors Women's Volleyball and Women's Golf as part of its varsity championship competition, which demonstrates that competition exists to sustain additional varsity sports not currently offered by Bloomsburg.

- 20. A number of universities in PSAC, Pennsylvania, and Bloomsburg's competitive region have rugby club teams, making competition viable. Bloomsburg, California, Clarion, East Stroudsburg, Indiana, Kutztown, Lock Haven, Millersville, Shippensburg, Slippery Rock, and Westchester Universities of Pennsylvania all have women's club rugby teams.
- 21. Rugby is an NCAA emerging sport. At least six colleges currently sponsor women's varsity rugby (Eastern Illinois, West Chester, Bowdoin, Norwich, Quinnipiac, and Harvard).
- 22. A review of the Bloomsburg website does not reveal that Bloomsburg undertook any athletic interest surveys or other research into interest and competition to support the addition of women's varsity sports.
- 23. Bloomsburg's EADA data further indicates that the university provides inadequate and unequal funding for recruitment of female athletes. In 2012-13, Bloomsburg spent \$28,146 on men's recruitment and only \$14,160 on women's recruitment; women were allocated only 33% of the recruiting budget even though they account for 40.75 percent of the athletic population and 56.41 percent of the full-time undergraduate population.
- 24. Bloomsburg's 2012-13 EADA report also indicates that it allocates only 37 percent of its financial aid to women's teams (\$211,700) even though women make up 40 percent of its unduplicated count of athletic participants (263 male athletes and 175 female athletes).

#### IV. LEGAL ALLEGATIONS

- 25. Title IX provides that "[n]o person in the United States shall, on the basis of sex, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of or be subjected to discrimination under any education program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance." 20 U.S.C. § 1681(a).
- 26. Title IX regulations prohibit athletic programs from discriminating on the basis of sex in interscholastic, intercollegiate, club or intramural athletics offered by the institution. 34 C.F.R. § 106.41(a) (2000).
- 27. Title IX regulations require institutions that offer athletics programs to provide equal athletic opportunities to members of both sexes to participate in athletics. 34 C.F.R. § 106.41(c)(1).
- 28. Pursuant to the 1979 Title IX Policy Interpretation, compliance with Title IX's equal athletic participation requirement is measured by determining whether the educational institution meets one part of the following three-part test:
  - 1. Whether intercollegiate level participation opportunities for male and female students are provided in numbers substantially proportionate to their respective enrollments; or

- 2. Where the members of one sex have been and are underrepresented among intercollegiate athletes, whether the institution can show a history and continuing practice of program expansion which is demonstrably responsive to the developing interests and abilities of the members of that sex; or
- 3. Where the members of one sex are underrepresented among intercollegiate athletes, and the institution cannot show a history and continuing practice of program expansion, as described above, whether it can be demonstrated that the interests and abilities of the members of that sex have been fully and effectively accommodated by the present program.

United States Department of Health, Education, and Welfare, Office for Civil Rights, *Policy Interpretation; Title IX and Intercollegiate Athletics*, 44 Fed. Reg. 71413 (Dec. 11, 1979) [hereinafter *Policy Interpretation*].

- 29. In determining substantial proportionality under part one of the three-part test, OCR considers the number of opportunities that would have to be added to achieve proportionality and whether it would be sufficient to support another team. If there are a significant number of unaccommodated women, it is likely that a viable sport could be added and therefore the institution has not satisfied part one of the three-part test. United States Department of Education, Office for Civil Rights, *Clarification of Intercollegiate Athletics Policy Guidance: the Three-Part Test* (Jan. 16, 1996) [hereinafter *1996 Clarification*].
- 30. In determining whether an institution has a history and continuing practice of expansion under part two of the three-part test, OCR reviews the entire history of the athletic program and evaluates whether the institution has expanded participation opportunities for the underrepresented sex in a manner that was demonstrably responsive to their developing interests and abilities, considering a number of factors, including:
  - an institution's record of adding intercollegiate teams, or upgrading teams to intercollegiate status, for the underrepresented sex;
  - an institution's record of increasing the numbers of participants in intercollegiate athletics who are members of the underrepresented sex;
  - an institution's affirmative responses to requests by students or others for addition or elevation of sports; and
  - whether the institution has effective ongoing procedures for collecting, maintaining and analyzing information on the interest and abilities of students of the underrepresented sex, including monitoring athletic participation, and assessing interest and ability on a periodic basis.

United States Department of Education, Office for Civil Rights, *Intercollegiate Athletics Policy Clarification: The Three-Part Test- Part Three* (Apr. 20, 2010) [hereinafter 2010 Clarification]; 1996 Clarification.

- 31. In determining whether an institution has a continuing practice of program expansion, OCR will consider a number of factors, including:
  - an institution's current implementation of a nondiscriminatory policy or
    procedure for requesting the addition of sports (including the elevation of club or
    intramural teams) and the effective communication of the policy or procedure to
    students;
  - an institution's current implementation of a plan of program expansion that is responsive to developing interests and abilities; and
  - an institution's efforts to monitor developing interests and abilities of the underrepresented sex, for example, by conducting periodic nondiscriminatory assessments of developing interests and abilities and taking timely actions in response to the results.

## 2010 Clarification, 1996 Clarification.

- 32. OCR will not find a history and continuing practice of program expansion where an institution increases the proportional participation opportunities for the underrepresented sex by reducing opportunities for the overrepresented sex alone or by reducing participation opportunities for the overrepresented sex to a proportionately greater degree than for the underrepresented sex. 2010 Clarification, 1996 Clarification.
- 33. Part three of the three-part test requires an examination of whether there is an unmet interest in a particular sport, a sufficient ability to sustain a team in the sport, and a reasonable expectation for competition for a team in the sport. 2010 Clarification, 1996 Clarification.
- 34. Whether there is unmet interest and ability will be determined by examining a broad range of indicators, including whether the institution uses nondiscriminatory methods of assessing interest and ability, the elimination of a viable team for the unrepresented sex, multiple indicators of interest and ability, and frequency of conducting assessments. 2010 Clarification.
- 35. Sufficient interest can be established by student requests to add a sport or elevate a club sport, increases in club or intramural sport participation, responses to interviews and interest surveys, assessments of student athletic participation before entering the institution or in the secondary schools from which the university draws its students, and assessments of participation in intercollegiate sports in the institution's normal competitive regions. *Id*.
- 36. Ability may be established by the athletic accomplishments and competitive experience of club sports and admitted students, the opinions of coaches, administrators, and athletes, and student participation in other sports. *Id*.
- 37. Expectation of competition may be established through athletic opportunities offered by other schools with which the school competes or opportunities at other schools in the school's geographic area, including those against which the institution does not compete. *Id.*

- 38. Under part three of the three-part test, OCR will also examine an institution's recruitment practices. If an institution recruits potential student athletes for its men's teams, OCR will examine whether the institution is providing women's teams with substantially equal opportunities to recruit potential student athletes. *Id*.
- 39. Title IX also requires equal opportunity in the recruitment of student athletes where equal athletic opportunities are not present for male and female students. Compliance will be assessed by examining the recruitment practices of the athletic programs for both sexes and evaluating whether the financial and other resources made available for recruitment in male and female athletic programs are equivalently adequate to meet the needs of each program. 1979 Policy Interpretation.
- 40. Title IX requires equal treatment with respect to student athletic financial assistance. Pursuant to 34 C.F.R. 106.37(c), a college or university that awards athletic scholarships must grant awards to "members of each sex in proportion to the number of students of each sex participating in... intercollegiate athletics." This requirement has been interpreted to require that "the total amount of scholarship aid made available to men and women must be substantially proportionate to their [overall] participation rates." 1979 Policy Interpretation at 71415. OCR has further defined substantial proportionality with respect to financial assistance to be within 1%; any unexplained disparity of more than 1% is in violation of the "substantially proportionate" requirement. Office For Civil Rights, Dear Colleague Letter: Bowling Green State University (July 23, 1998).
- 41. Bloomsburg's own data, as outlined in the Factual Allegations above, demonstrate that it is not providing equal opportunities for its female students to participate in sports under Title IX's three-part participation test, and equivalent recruiting resources and athletic financial assistance as required by Title IX.

## V. RELIEF REQUESTED

- 42. The Women's Law Project requests that OCR:
  - a. Investigate Bloomsburg University of Pennsylvania to determine whether it is providing female students with equal participation opportunities to participate in varsity athletics sports and equivalently adequate recruitment opportunities and athletic financial assistance.
  - b. Take all necessary steps to remedy any unlawful conduct that it identifies in its investigation, as required by Title IX and its implementing regulations.
  - c. If any violations are found, secure assurances of compliance with Title IX from Bloomsburg University, as well as full remedies for the violations found.
  - d. Among other steps to achieve compliance with Title IX, require
    Bloomsburg University to: elevate interested existing women's club teams

to varsity status, identify, add more athletic opportunities for women, accord to additional teams and athletes the full range of benefits accorded to varsity teams and athletes, increase recruiting opportunities and athletically related student assistance for women's teams, and adopt and implement a plan to achieve compliance with Title IX.

e. Monitor any resulting agreement with Bloomsburg University to ensure that Bloomsburg University achieves compliance with Title IX.

Respectfully submitted,

Terry L. Fromson Women's Law Project 125 S. 9<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 300 Philadelphia, PA 19107

215-928-5771

Date: April 16, 2014